

DRAFT – Sept. 25, 2018

**Initial Report to the Office of Governor Jerry Brown:
Counting All Californians in the 2020 Census**

CONTENTS

Section 1. Introduction 1

Section 2. Background on the Census and California..... 2

Section 3. Census Roles and Partnerships..... 7

Section 4. California Complete Count Committee 11

Section 5. Initial Outreach Concerns and Response Strategies..... 13

Section 5a. Housing 15

Section 5b. Trust and Confidentiality 17

Section 5c. Access and Outreach..... 20

Section 5d. Content and Citizenship 25

Section 6. Next Steps..... 28

APPENDIX A: California Complete Count Committee Membership 29

APPENDIX B: References 31

Section 1. Introduction

As mandated in Article I, Section 2 of the Constitution, every 10 years, the federal government counts ~~the number of people~~all persons living in the United States (U.S.). The U.S. Census Bureau collects this information, and the U.S. Census Bureau and individual states conduct outreach to publicize and support the count. The federal government then uses the information to determine how many federal dollars flow to each state and how many members of Congress each state will have.

With its highly diverse population and size, the State of California (State) faces the greatest barriers in the nation to ensure that it receives an accurate count and thus receives an fair equitable share of funding and representation.

To overcome these challenges, the State is undertaking an extensive outreach strategy for the federal 2020 Census to encourage full participation among State residents. In support of the strategy, the Governor has created an advisory committee, the California Complete Count Committee (Committee). The Committee is a volunteer panel of 25 community leaders representing diverse populations from across the State. It is charged with raising awareness of the Census, collaborating to support outreach efforts, and offering its expertise and insights on outreach strategies.

Historically, the State has focused its outreach and communication efforts on the areas of greatest impact: communities historically undercounted in the Census. These “hard to count” (HTC) populations are defined by the U. S. Census Bureau using several variables, including but not limited to: housing conditions, low-income status, immigration status, reliance on languages other than English, mobility, and displacement by disasters. Of particular note are communities of color, children and rural residents as these groups fall within historically undercounted populations.

In this Initial Report to the Governor’s Office, the Committee provides background on the critical importance of outreach to Californians around the 2020 Census and the status of State actions and plans for 2020. The Committee presents initial areas of concern and recommendations for State 2020 Census outreach.

The Governor’s Executive Order (EO) of April 2018 (EO B-49-18) established the Committee to advise on and assist in the State’s outreach strategy. The Committee and its Working Groups (described later in this report) receive presentations from experts within and outside of State government and prepare recommendations to develop and implement the State’s 2020 Census outreach and communication strategies. The Committee shares its thinking and recommendations, and the status and results of outreach efforts, through this and follow-up reports to the Governor on a biannual basis through June 30, 2021.

Section 2. Background on the Census and California

The stakes for the 2020 California Census count are high. An undercount can result in the loss of billions of dollars of federal funds, as well as congressional representation in the U.S. House of Representatives. The California Department of Finance estimated that during the 2010 Census, there was an undercount of approximately 1.5 million Californians. The data collected by the Census is used to distribute federal funds to states. For California, this translates to funding for more than 70 federal programs including but not limited to Medi-Cal, Medicare, ~~food stamps~~the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (commonly referred to as “food stamps”), roads, school programs, school lunches, children’s health insurance, Head Start and foster care. In short, an accurate and complete Census count is essential for ~~California~~the well-being of all Californians.

2020 Census Challenges

There are ongoing and unique challenges to ensure that all residents are accurately counted in 2020. Ongoing challenges include accurately and completely accounting for traditionally undercounted or HTC populations, including those who are foreign-born and non-citizen residents, children under five years of age, minority populations, and those who live in rental or temporary housing.

The 2020 Census also presents several unique challenges, including the first ever digital census, the inclusion of a specific question about citizenship, intensifying fears among immigrants due to the current political and social climate, rising public distrust of government, the lack of trust in the security of personal and online information, and reduced federal funding. The following provides brief descriptions of some of these unique challenges.

First Digital Census

For the first time in history, as part of modernization and cost-cutting efforts, there is an option to complete the Census survey online. While this may reduce costs and increase participation in the long run, it is a substantial change for the public and the impact is unknown. There are predictions of a depressed census count among numerous populations due to limited digital access, cybersecurity concerns, or lack of digital literacy.

Census Citizenship Question

One of the most significant changes to the 2020 Census questionnaire is the addition of the citizenship question. Although the Census Bureau has not conducted sufficient research and testing of the citizenship question in the Census environment, as is typically done for such changes, the Census Bureau has evidence from the American Community Survey (ACS) that including the citizenship question suppresses responses. As such, adding this question will likely discourage immigrants, both citizens and noncitizens, from participating and will result in an inaccurate count as well as reduced representation and allocation of resources for states with large numbers of immigrants. Furthermore, the inclusion of this question will increase the cost

of conducting the Census by reducing overall response and requiring additional resources for follow up.

Increasing Immigrant Fears & Distrust

The federal administration's focus on immigration and strict enforcement of immigration laws have led to uncertainty about how immigrants will respond.

Lack of Trust in Government & Security of Information

Surveys show a widening distrust of government and similar institutions among diverse groups of people for a variety of reasons. In addition, many Americans are concerned about data confidentiality. The increasing distrust and concern about confidentiality may impact traditional methods of gathering Census by influencing residents to skip the Census altogether, or refusing to open doors to Census enumerators.

Lack of Early Federal Funding

The 2020 Census has been impacted from the delayed appointment of a permanent 2020 U.S. Census Bureau Director and Deputy Director, as well as a mandate to keep costs at 2010 levels. The result has been program cuts, including cuts to usability testing, improvements to user experience, and cybersecurity safeguarding. Congress did approve a significant increase in funding for Census in March 2018.

California's Unique Challenges

While grappling with the same challenges faced at the federal level, California has considerable challenges of its own in the mission for an accurate and complete count. California is the largest and hardest to count state, with a large number of foreign-born residents and significant populations of some of the nation's hardest to count populations.

Non-Native English Speakers

Estimates show that California's population has grown by more than two million residents since the 2010 Census, with 42% of residents speaking a language other than English at home. Californians speak more than 200 non-English languages. According to the latest Census Operational Plan draft in the Federal Register, the U.S. Census Bureau will provide the online census form and telephone/electronic census assistance in 12 languages other than English; the paper form in English and Spanish – a departure from the six languages included in 2010; and limit the language assistance provided for online and telephone questionnaires. Language guides and glossaries will be provided for 59 languages. This poses a challenge to effectively message and connect to the State's many non-native English speakers.

Hard to Count Populations

Twenty percent of California census tracts are in the hardest to count category, and 66% of California census tracts are harder to count than the national average (calculated based on Low Response Scores). Among its hard to count populations, in 2017⁵, California was home to almost 10.7 million foreign born residents, over 17.5 million residents living in rental housing, over 24.3⁹ million residents who are non-white, mixed race, or Hispanic, over 2.5 million

children under the age of five, and an estimated 2 million undocumented residents. A very high percentage of California residents fall within at least one HTC category.

California's Response to 2020 Census Challenges

While the 2020 Census poses challenges, lessons learned from previous census counts are informing efforts to reach HTC populations in California.

Building on Lessons Learned from 2000 & 2010 Census Efforts

During the 2000 Census effort, the Legislature and Governor allocated \$24.7 million for a dual-pronged State effort involving a targeted, multi-lingual, multi-media advertising campaign and focused outreach, in partnership with regional, culturally appropriate-competent organizations that used trusted messengers to engage HTC communities. The strategy achieved a 5% increase in the state response rate, and California performed better than the national average, 70% versus 67%.

In 2010, with drastically limited resources during the great recession, the California Complete Count Committee staff's efforts focused on convening, coordinating and building the capacity of embedded leaders in HTC communities to do direct outreach. Community leaders with established networks, relationships and trust within their communities received support from the State to conduct grassroots Census outreach efforts. The U.S. Census Bureau also benefited from this level of organization, by capitalizing on valuable networks and resources at state and local levels.

A Robust Effort for 2020

These past successful strategies provide the foundation for the State's approach to 2020 Census outreach, which the State is adapting to today's context and needs. Critical for success in 2020 will be understanding the new and challenging environment; leveraging the resources of extensive partner networks; and coordinating outreach efforts at the State, local and federal levels.

State leaders have made a sizeable commitment to the 2020 Census by investing approximately \$100 million towards upcoming strategies and other tasks that will help ensure an accurate and successful count of all Californians. Specifically:

- The 2017 Budget Act provided \$3 million to the Governor's Office of Planning and Research for initial planning activities.
- The 2017 Budget Act also included \$7 million for the State Department of Finance to offer incentives to cities and counties to update address information for the U.S. Census Bureau's address update process, termed the Local Update of Census Address Operation (see Page 8 for more information on this operation).
- The 2018 Budget Act includes an additional \$90.3 million for statewide outreach and strategies that aim to increase the participation rate of California's hard-to-count populations in the decennial census.

The State's outreach and communication strategy is in initial stages of development. Key methods executed or planned for 2020 to date include:

- Formation of the **Statewide California Complete Count Committee** in April 2018.
- Statewide needs/readiness assessment process, including conducting 24 **Regional Convenings** held throughout the State.
- Initial **strategic outreach partnering with trusted messengers** to reach and support HTC communities, including greatly extended support for local community-based organizations (CBO) to conduct multi-lingual, culturally competent outreach and support. Partnerships may include but may not be limited to:
 - Faith-based organizations, CBOs and non-governmental organizations (NGOs)
 - Foundations
 - State agencies
 - Local governments
 - Schools
 - Local Assistance Centers
 - Offices of local elected officials
 - Caseworkers
 - Unions
- **Targeted multi-media, multi-lingual messaging** with an emphasis on culturally and linguistically competent content, partnering with ethnic media, and extensive testing and the use of sector and region-specific messaging toolkits. Communications will include advertising, social media, publicity and promotions. As part of communication support, the State is helping private message testing organizations to coordinate and share information with each other to reduce gaps and duplication of effort.
- **New technological tools and capacities.** The state has contracted with ESRI, the company that makes ArcGIS mapping software, to craft and launch **SWORD**, an interactive, cloud-based **Statewide Outreach and Rapid Deployment platform**. SWORD will host and collect California Census information and foster sharing, coordination and collaboration, and informed planning and decision-making among all outreach and messaging partners, including local governments, foundations, and CBOs/NGOs. The platform will host interactive mapping capabilities to share spatial data and assist in targeting groups and census tracts with low response rates.
- **Development of school curriculum on the Census.** The State is working with the Sacramento, Los Angeles, and Fresno County Offices of Education to develop and pilot school-based 2020 Census classroom curriculum for 5th, 8th, 11th and 12th grade students. The U.S. Census Bureau will partner in implementing these pilots in school districts in the involved counties.

The State's 2020 Census effort is staffing up, establishing operational structures, and starting to coordinate with partners. Through 2020, State outreach and communication will move through three phases:

- Phase 1: Convene, Collaborate, Capacity Build – FY 17/18
- Phase 2: Educate, Motivate, Activate – FY 18/19
- Phase 3: Count (Deploy, Count, Assess) – FY 19/20
- Closeout: Nonresponse follow up, results, report, wrap-up – July-December 2020

The State is currently in Phase 1.

DRAFT

Section 3. Census Roles and Partnerships

Many governmental and nongovernmental organizations throughout the State will have significant involvement in the 2020 Census, bringing diverse sets of strengths and expertise to the process, and working within different opportunities and constraints. To achieve a California complete count in 2020, and to utilize resources efficiently, a broad range of collaborations and partnerships will be needed. This section describes some of the core roles that various organizations will play in the 2020 Census.

Federal Government: U.S. Census Bureau

While the State plans to dedicate extensive resources to the 2020 Census, there is a clear division of responsibility and roles between the State and the federal government. Many areas that are within the federal government's purview are not open to State involvement. Key federal responsibilities include:

Design and Conduct the Census

The federal government has the constitutional responsibility to design and conduct the Census (via the work of the U.S. Census Bureau). While the federal government takes input from states, it makes the final decisions about the implementation of the Census. This includes but is not limited to tasks such as development and testing of the Census form, hiring census enumerators, and similar.

Update of Census Addresses

The federal government is responsible to verify and update the national database of addresses, referred to as the Master Address File. The U.S. Census Bureau partners with state, local and tribal governments, offering them an opportunity to review and send updates to this address list through a process called the Local Update of Census Addresses Operation (LUCA). That process has ended for the 2020 Census, but local governments will learn results of their work in summer 2019, and will have an opportunity to appeal decisions made on addresses suggested but not incorporated.

Data Confidentiality

The federal government is responsible to protect confidential data that residents provide on census forms. Under Title 13 of the U.S. Code, Section 9, census data is strictly protected as confidential, and it is illegal for the U.S. Census Bureau or any federal employees to share personal information with any other government agency, local law enforcement, health and human services, the White House, etc. Under Title 13, all Census Bureau employees swear a lifetime oath to protect confidential information and risk a felony conviction, up to five years imprisonment, and/or a \$250,000 fine if they violate Title 13.

Training of Local Complete Count Committees

The U.S. Census Bureau works with local governments to help them set up and train members of local Complete Count Committees who work to raise local awareness of the Census.

State Government: Governor's Office, Government Operations Agency, and California Complete Count Office

Outreach and Communication

While the responsibility of the Census count and related data management rests with the U.S. Census Bureau, the State, through the California Complete Count Office of the Government Operations Agency will conduct a robust outreach and communication effort to reach and inform California's many diverse residents. To accomplish this, the Complete Count Office will employ an experienced, diverse, multi-lingual staff to design and execute outreach efforts. It will partner with local governments, foundations, and CBOs / NGOs to ensure outreach is undertaken by trusted messengers, is culturally and linguistically appropriate, and targets the significant HTC communities in the state.

Filling Gaps

The State will help fill gaps in U.S. Census Bureau outreach, communication and support, and publicize or support federal programs and actions. For example, the State can provide outreach materials in languages not provided by the federal government; help to publicize Census enumerator hiring opportunities; and can fund navigators or other outreach to HTC populations.

California Complete Count Committee

The Committee lends its expertise to advise the State on outreach, communication and access issues. Its members work with their networks and communities to spread awareness of the Census and to collaborate with partners to support Census outreach.

Strategic, Local Partnerships

It is envisioned that a significant part of California's outreach strategy to reach HTC populations is the formation and support of strategic, local partnerships. Foundations, CBOs, NGOs, non-profits, local government agencies, and local elected officials are critical to leverage existing networks, resources and expertise. This relational, grassroots approach will provide valuable infrastructure to adapt messaging and outreach strategies, based on continually changing political and social circumstances and incoming data on Census non-participation. State and foundation funding will serve to enhance the resources and reach of these partner organizations during the 2020 Census.

Local Government

Local counties and cities play a significant role to ensure their populations are aware of the Census, and are ready to be counted. The following provides examples of these roles.

Update of Census Addresses

As mentioned above, in California, local governments update addresses for the Census through the LUCA. In addition, they may work with CBOs to canvas neighborhoods for unconventional housing and similar conditions that might result in a local undercount. The timeframe for submitting addresses for 2020, as noted above, has passed, but local governments will have an opportunity in 2019 to appeal once the U.S. Census Bureau releases its updated address list.

With incentives offered by the State to local governments, California local governments participated in the 2020 LUCA operation at a significantly higher rate than the national average. More than 90 percent of California counties and more than 84 percent of California cities participated in LUCA, compared to about 60 percent of counties and about 37% of cities nationally.

Local Government Complete Count Committees

Complete Count Committees are being formed at the local level to conduct focused outreach and increase the count. They will use local knowledge and resources to inform and promote targeted outreach efforts. They can provide a nexus between local and state governments, CBOs / NGOs, communities, the U.S. Census Bureau, and similar.

Native American Tribal Governments and Communities

The U.S. Census Bureau conducts government-to-government relationships with federally recognized Tribes. Starting in 1990, the Bureau began hiring tribal members as enumerators and other positions. Tribes, like states, may experience reductions in federal funding because of undercounts, which are significant on tribal lands. Tribes may participate in the LUCA, or delegate their authority to a state or local government. In addition, Tribes may interact with the US Census Bureau on other Bureau programs, including sharing information about tribal boundaries for the yearly Boundary and Annexation Survey and the Tribal Statistical Areas Program. In the 2020 Census, the U.S. Census Bureau is also using a Tribal Government Liaison Program to share information and develop a trusted relationship with participating Tribes. The State government is initiating government-to-government consultation with California Native American Tribes (both federally-recognized and non-federally recognized) to explore opportunities to partner with Tribes around outreach and communication to all Native Americans in California. There is a need to outreach and engage with Native Americans in California that do not live on tribal lands. That may include California natives as well as Native Americans that work or live in California native communities, but whose tribes are located elsewhere in the U.S.

Non-Governmental and Community Based Organizations, Foundations

Foundations NGOs, CBOs and similar are essential partners to reach, inform and support California's HTC populations.

Messaging and Outreach

Foundations, NGOs and CBOs are already leading the research on messaging and designing communication strategies. A wide variety of these organizations are involved, supporting efforts such as canvassing unconventional addresses, organizing neighborhood-based events and face-to-face efforts; serving as trusted messengers to HTC communities, and offering information about where to find and count people who might otherwise be overlooked.

Group Quarters Administrators

Administrators of jails, prisons, dormitories, long-term care facilities and other institutions that house large numbers of people who do not have other addresses, have a unique responsibility during the Census: they provide the information about the number and pertinent personal information of each resident to the U.S. Census Bureau.

DRAFT

Section 4. California Complete Count Committee

As stated above, the Committee brings together public and private partners from across the State to increase awareness about the Census, encourage all Californians to participate, and assist with the development of an effective California outreach strategy. Committee membership and associated background information is presented in Appendix A.

The Committee meets quarterly. Its activities include, but are not limited to:

- Provide expertise and insight and recommend effective outreach strategies to the California Complete Count Office. A compiled first draft of the strategy will be delivered to the Governor's Office by October 1, 2018.
- Use individual and collective knowledge, expertise, and influence to encourage all communities, particularly HTC communities, to complete the 2020 Census questionnaire in a timely and accurate manner.

The role of each Committee member is to:

- Raise awareness about Census efforts to community leaders and guide them to develop strategies for a complete and accurate count in their respective communities.
- Provide expertise to develop an outreach strategy leveraging existing community partnerships.
- Participate as experts, and/or collaborate with other experts, on Census established working groups.
- Identify effective outreach strategies and provide recommendations to the California Complete Count Office.

Working Groups

To help develop a robust strategy, the Committee formed four internal Working Groups to conduct focused inquiry and discussion and develop recommended strategies on specific areas of concern regarding Census outreach and participation.

- The **Content and Citizenship** Working Group considers Census questionnaire content matters, including the citizenship, gender, race and ethnicity questions.
- The **Trust and Confidentiality** Working Group looks at security, confidentiality of personal information, ways to build trust, and how to best educate Californians on risks, protections and benefits of census participation.
- The **Access and Outreach** Working Group's focus includes communication with diverse populations, adequate language access, digital literacy, and how to best outreach to historically undercounted and HTC communities.

- The **Housing** Working Group considers the challenges of counting residents who are experiencing homelessness or housing instability, or who may live in places that lack a formal address, including where and how such populations will be counted.

Each Working Group has established its purpose and prepared an initial list of concerns and recommended strategies. These are presented in the next section.

DRAFT

Section 5. Initial Outreach Concerns and Response Strategies

Initial concerns and recommended strategies identified by the Committee are presented below. This input highlights initial perspectives to inform the State's development of its overall communication and outreach strategy for the 2020 Census, a first draft of which will be completed by October 1, 2018. These early concerns and recommendations represent initial thinking by the Committee and its Working Groups. Members of the Working Groups will provide expanded conclusions and refined recommendations in future reports to the Governor.

The Working Groups were tasked to specify their individual purposes and/or goals, and were given broad latitude to create their own approaches on how to identify issues of concern and develop concerns and recommendations related to their areas of focus. As a result, each Working Group chose a slightly unique way to develop and communicate outcomes from their deliberations. For that reason, the following sections are formatted similarly, but not identically.

While the Working Groups have distinct charges, and each held discussions and developed recommendations independently, several of the initial issues of concern and strategies overlap significantly between two or more of the Groups. This congruence underscores important themes identified by a broad range of the diverse Committee membership. In addition, attendees at the 24 regional 2020 Census convenings around the State emphasized similar themes and concerns, indicating the importance of these issues across a wide variety of communities and partners.

These initial, important common topic areas include:

- Identifying trusted messengers to best communicate with HTC communities
- Utilizing ethnic media to communicate with HTC communities.
- The need to conduct focused outreach to those experiencing homelessness, housing instability and/or living in unconventional housing.
- Culturally competent messaging and outreach to diverse HTC communities.
- The growing environment of public fear and/or distrust of government, in concert with the first digital census and the question on citizenship.

Process

The Working Groups began their work with an initial round of meetings in early to mid-July to discuss roles, areas of focus, and desired deliverables. A second round of meetings was held on July 30, 2018 in conjunction with the full Committee meeting in Sacramento. Each Working Group crafted its own agenda for the July 30th meetings; two Working Groups hosted presentations related to their area of focus; all four Working Groups held focused discussions on topics related to this report, including purpose, desired outcomes and concerns and

recommended strategies. Working Groups met again in late August to finalize their initial input to this Initial Report.

Using a collaborative discussion and voting methods, the Committee reviewed the report and in particular, the initial concerns and recommended strategies. Committee members discussed the appropriateness to include specific information and conducted numerous non-binding assessments to ensure that each member could support the initial information. On completion of robust discussion and iterative assessments of support, the Committee Chair conducted a formal roll call vote to ensure that the content in this report reflected the Committee's collective support and that it was ready to be presented to the Governor.

DRAFT

Section 5a. Housing

Purpose of the Housing Working Group

To identify every type of place a HTC person could live in California, and to propose strategies about where and how to count them, based on their unique housing/living situation during the 2020 Census enumeration period.

Initial Issues of Concern: Non-traditionally Housed Individuals Missed in the Census Count

California communities have emerging populations of individuals who reside in unconventional housing. Traditional outreach will miss populations that do not have addresses or who experience housing instability. These individuals may live on the street, in cars, or in unconventional housing such as converted garages or backyard trailers. They may also live in non-traditional households, as when multiple families or unrelated individuals share one address.

Initial Issues of Concern: Current Housing Identification Methods are Insufficient

The U.S. Census Bureau's LUCA does not include all unconventional housing arrangements. Recent studies conducted in Fresno, San Jose, San Francisco, and Stockton, found that up to 6% of housing units in Census tracts were not included.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- Create a clear, comprehensive, and evidence-based description of all non-traditional places and unconventional housing units where people need to be counted.
- Clarify special populations of people who are experiencing homelessness and housing instability and where they are most likely to reside.
- Identify trusted organizations and messengers on the ground that are best suited to reach people who may be experiencing homelessness, housing instability, and/or are living in non-traditional arrangements.
- Educate and motivate local governments to continue to follow through on the LUCA appeals process to improve the accuracy of the Master Address File.

Populations that need to be outreached to include:

- Vulnerable sectors the U.S. Census Bureau considers HTC, such as :
 - Low-income
 - People of color
 - Immigrants
 - Limited English proficient
 - Veterans
 - People with disabilities
 - Children

- Those experiencing personal circumstances during the count that make them harder for enumerators to find, such as individuals who are:
 - Experiencing homelessness and/or couch surfing
 - Migrant workers
 - Previously incarcerated
 - Foster youth
 - Young and mobile
 - Transition-aged and aging out of foster care
 - College students

- Those living in unconventional places, such as individuals who are:
 - Living in unconventional housing
 - Living in tent cities
 - Members of multiple-family households
 - Incarcerated, including in juvenile detention

Potential locations or organizations to outreach to these populations include:

- Navigation centers
- Education institutions at all levels
- Safe spaces these individuals may frequently attend, including churches and other religious and community institutions
- Organizations that work with homeless communities
- Group quarters

Section 5b. Trust and Confidentiality

Purpose of the Trust and Confidentiality Working Group

To develop goals and recommendations that build a high level of trust in confidentiality of Census information to encourage all Californians to participate fully.

Goal #1: Provide ideas as to how the State can supplement protection for the confidentiality of peoples' Census information from federal government misuse, technological breach, or misuse by any other party.

Initial Issues of Concern: Goal #1

- The potential for federal-level sharing of census data, between federal agency departments, in violation of Title 13.
- The possibility that CBOs, NGOs and similar organizations tasked with Census outreach and/or collecting Census data are not properly trained to maintain confidentiality of data.
- Errant government employees potentially sharing data without authorization.
- Breach and hacking of the data storage systems.
- The unprecedented level of distrust in the federal government by many Californians; and the general feeling of uncertainty that the current federal administration will follow federal law.
- The inclusion of highly sensitive questions in the Census form, such as the citizenship question, generates fear, given the current federal administration's focus on expanding immigration enforcement.
- Digital census forms may provide greater opportunity for data breach.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- The State collect and collate a list of all existing legal protections for the confidentiality of census information provided by both State and federal law.
- The State consider supplementing legal protections for Census information, even if State-level protections are redundant ~~to~~ of federal law. This would reassure the public on confidentiality of data. For example, the California Attorney General's Office could join with other state attorneys general to offer a shield mechanism for confidential data.

- The State consider what can be done by governments or NGOs beyond legal or legislative actions to bolster the public’s trust that confidentiality will be upheld.

Goal #2: Suggest messaging that will build higher trust with all HTC communities, and inspire census participation.

Initial Issues of Concern: Goal #2

- California has a large number of different HTC communities, and a diverse number of residents that fall within traditionally HTC communities.
- Messaging is never “one size fits all.” Messaging should be specific and tailored to different community groups, locations, etc. Furthermore, messaging, messengers and outreach methods should be culturally relevant/significant.
- The U.S. Census Bureau may not have sufficient resources to conduct outreach to all HTC communities. There is an opportunity for the State to fill gaps left by federal level messaging efforts.
- California has a high number of Temporary Protected Status (TPS) communities (people who may temporarily reside legally in the United States after the federal government has determined their country’s conditions are unsafe for return) In the future, these communities might transition from being lawfully permitted to undocumented in status.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- The State should work with appropriate persons to identify how the occurrence or dissolution of TPS might impact efforts to ensure a complete count across the State.
- Incorporate the use of ethnic media (print and digital) in Census outreach methods and information distribution.
- The State should consider what can be done outside law to bolster the public’s trust that confidentiality will be upheld, such as informal activity within governments or by NGOs / CBOs.

Goal #3: Identify current and developing concerns on the ground, and develop specific strategies or tactics to address these specific concerns.

Initial Issue of Concern: Goal #3

Census is a dynamic effort. It is nearly impossible to anticipate what might trigger new Census-related concerns within communities (for example, a proposed boycott from a community, an action taken by the federal government, etc.)

Recommended Initial Strategies

- No initial strategies suggested yet for Goal #3.

DRAFT

Section 5c. Access and Outreach

Purpose of the Access and Outreach Working Group

California and Californians are very diverse. This diversity includes but is not limited to historically undercounted communities and communities diverse in race, age, ability, level of literacy, language and language access, digital access, sexual orientation, residential status, citizenship status, and socioeconomic status. The purpose of this Working Group is to develop recommendations and smart strategies related to:

Access – so that all of California’s diverse communities, for the purpose of being counted, have access to:

- ~~The Census~~ Official Census information and forms, via digital, paper, phone and in-person methods;
- Necessary information, materials, and support related to the Census;
- The languages necessary to understand and receive that information, materials and support; and
- Jobs related to Census enumeration and outreach.

Outreach – so that:

- The State and its partners can reach California’s diverse HTC communities;
- Information materials and marketing strategies are developed and implemented with the State’s diversity in mind;
- All diverse communities know the importance of the Census; and
- All residents have access to and assistance in being counted in 2020.

Initial Issue of Concern: Language and Language Access

The U.S. Census Bureau will provide the online census form and telephone/electronic census assistance in only 12 languages other than English, and the paper form in only English and Spanish. Language guides and glossaries will be provided for 59 languages. However, there are more than 200 different primary languages spoken throughout California, and many of those speaking these languages speak little to no English. It is important that translated materials are accurate, appropriate and culturally sensitive in the respective language.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- State census materials should be produced in as many languages as possible, or at a minimum, for the maximum number of languages the State currently has capacity to

support. The State should place highest priority on those languages other than the 12 languages supported by the U.S. Census Bureau.

- A bilingual review committee should be formed for each language to review translated materials and ensure that they are translated accurately and in a way that is culturally competent.

Initial Issue of Concern: Digital Access

For the first time, the Census will be available online, and the U.S. Census Bureau will prioritize receiving responses online as a cost efficiency measure. The emphasis on the online mode may impose access barriers to populations who are less proficient at interacting online, or who have limited or no digital access.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- Develop messaging to communities that have limited to no digital access so that they have access to census survey information via phone or paper forms.
- Ensure that all internet information is mobile accessible.

Initial Issue of Concern: Diversity of Census Enumerators

In the past, census enumerators could be non-citizens. This not the case for the 2020 Census. To increase the likelihood that the enumerator population is reflective of diverse communities, thereby increasing their access to the Census, many more HTC community members must apply than the number of open positions that exists.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- To ensure the population of enumerators hired by the U.S. Census Bureau for California is reflective of the diverse communities the enumerators will be working with, the State should include a requirement for contractors and county-level Complete Count Committees that they prioritize outreaching to HTC communities about enumerator recruitment, and share job announcements when they are posted by the U.S. Census Bureau.
- The State should fund hiring of community navigators to help answer census questions and fill the gaps in enumerator HTC community expertise and familiarity.

Initial Issue of Concern: Historically Undercounted Communities

Historically undercounted communities, particularly those that have received minimal outreach around the Census in the past, will remain in the same condition ~~for~~ the 2020 Census.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- The State should:
 - Review statewide data to identify historically undercounted communities;
 - Prioritize these communities' needs;
 - Identify the respective barriers these communities face; and
 - Develop approaches to overcome these specific barriers.

Initial Issue of Concern: Accessibility of Information to People with Disabilities

People with disabilities, including sensory disabilities such as deafness or blindness, face barriers to access Census information and to participate in the Census. Many web-based materials may not be easily accessible to people with disabilities.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- State and federal Census materials should be developed to be accessible to people with disabilities. This would include making materials available in braille, extra-large font and American Sign Language, and ensuring that online materials are screen-reader and contrast/resolution accessible.
- Before being published, sample materials should be tested by a committee of diverse disability community representatives, including communities with intellectual, mental health, physical and sensory disabilities.

Initial Issue of Concern: Literacy Level of Outreach Materials

Outreach materials may not be accessible to the full range of reading-literacy levels and thus the greatest number of people.

Recommended Initial Strategy

- Utilize “plain language” in Census outreach and informational materials, keeping reading level in mind when developing content.

Initial Issue of Concern: Outreach to Non-Traditional Housing and Housing Instable Populations

The myriad of non-traditional housing arrangements of California residents will contribute to challenges in outreach, and as a result, these HTC communities will be undercounted. For example, when multiple families live in a single-family residence, only one family may be targeted by U.S. Census Bureau outreach. Residents living in converted garages and basements without a separate address will be overlooked. Residents living in group quarters such as prisons, jails and dorms do not receive individually targeted census outreach. Some group quarters administrators have highly efficient systems to count and report populations to the

U.S. Census Bureau, while others do not. In addition, there are outreach challenges for populations who are likely to be more mobile, such as those on probation, students who may be in-state or out-of-state, or others who may transition housing during the count.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- Consult with the State Department of Finance and other entities with data on non-traditional housing.
- Consider how to best outreach to people in non-traditional and housing instable situations so they have information on how and when to complete the census form. For example, identify responsible administrators at prisons who will complete the census form on behalf of all persons currently residing there.
- U.S. Census Bureau provide the California Complete Count Committee a briefing on group quarters enumeration and outreach methods to better inform development of enhanced recommendations for access and outreach strategies.

Initial Issue of Concern: Apathy and/or Lack of Trust in Government

Among the general public, there is distrust of government at the State, federal and local levels, as well as concerns around how census information about individuals might be used. This distrust may be further projected on to enumerators, census kiosk workers, trusted messengers, media campaigns, and others providing census outreach and support.

Recommended Initial Strategy

- Create census media messaging that includes trusted messengers, and is tailored to and responsive to a particular community culture.

Initial Issue of Concern: Media Messaging

Media messaging and associated efforts may be inconsistent with or not adequately informed by HTC and local communities over the course of the Census outreach period. Media contracts could go to organizations that do not have an established history of working in and with HTC communities.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- The State should have contracting rules in place that support smaller media entities such as ethnic and local media and additionally, provide selection priority to organizations that have a record of working with HTC communities. For example, letters of recommendation from HTC community representatives might be used to determine those media entities that are trusted by communities; or other requirements may be put in place to demonstrate that contractors have a connection and commitment to

local communities. This requirement may need to be written in to the State's request for proposals process for media contracting.

- Media outlets that are contracted for Census outreach should consult with key leaders and trusted messengers within the communities of concern to develop, review, and approve appropriate media campaign strategies.
- All forms of media should be used to reach all Californians, and use of ethnic media that are trusted by local communities should be prioritized.

Initial Issue of Concern: Efficiency of Outreach Efforts

With the diverse array of state and local governments, NGOs and CBOs, and others engaged in 2020 Census outreach, there may be an inefficient use of resources as different entities duplicate efforts.

Recommended Initial Strategy

- Communicate with CBOs, NGOs and similar to understand the types of outreach efforts they plan in order to maximize resources and avoid duplication of efforts.

DRAFT

Section 5d. Content and Citizenship

Purpose of the Content and Citizenship Working Group

Advise California Complete Count Staff and the Governor's Office on outreach and media strategies to encourage Census participation among California residents who may be deterred from filling out the census form because of the following questionnaire content issues:

1. Mixed status households, non-citizen residents and other respondents may be deterred because of a citizenship question, general distrust of, or unfamiliarity with government, and other participation barriers.
2. The lack of Census questions on gender identity and sexual orientation; the lack of a Middle Eastern or North African (MENA) category; and the framing of the race and ethnicity questions around Latino, Hispanic or Spanish origin and race. Communities need guidance to know how to accurately self-identify on the current Census form.

Initial Issues of Concern: Hiring Trusted Messengers

- Individuals with specific cultural and linguistic skills to reach households that may not trust the census process, may not be hired.
- Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) youth and non-citizens who can convince other non-citizens of the importance of filling out the census form may not be hired. The federal government has not approved waivers to hire non-citizens that may be trusted messengers working in census offices or as enumerators.
- There may be inadequate research and information to accurately identify who trusted messengers are for various communities across California, especially those who will be impacted most by the inclusion of the citizenship question.

Initial Issues of Concern: Adequate Infrastructure to Address Cyber Security and Misinformation

California may not have adequate infrastructure to adequately address potential issues and concerns with cyber security, the use of social media to spread misinformation, the erosion of public trust in media and government, and the security of personal information.

Initial Issues of Concern: Census Participation Boycotts

Various groups may boycott the census and there is a need to quickly and effectively address this through educational messaging stressing the consequences of non-participation for Californians.

Initial Issues of Concern: Accurate Self-Identification

There is a need for education and information on how to accurately self-identify on the census questionnaire in light of limited categories for ethnicity and family structure, as well as the inclusion of citizenship question.

Recommended Initial Strategies

- Educate all Californians on what is at stake with each census count, how data is being collected and how it will be used.
 - Educational materials should provide accurate information on how to self-identify, and what happens in the case of census partial response.
 - Educational outreach efforts should focus on helping people understand their personal connection to the census, how they will benefit from accurately filling out the census form, and how the risks of providing this information are outweighed by the benefits.
- Fund organizations who best understand how to reach non-citizen residents during the census count, and concentrate outreach efforts based on geographically concentrated areas of HTC populations.
 - Prioritization should be given to organizations that have a proven track record and recent and long-standing historical relationships with HTC and non-citizen resident communities.
 - Focus on organizations that help non-citizens attain legal permanent residency, naturalization, health care and social services.
 - Funding should also go to civic engagement coalitions that work with families and immigrants such as the Million Voters Project.
- Identify trusted messengers in multiple spheres, including family, church, and other local community leaders who can accurately convey the importance of participating in the census, and what is at stake for Californians.
 - Engage community leaders connected with smaller, targeted HTC populations (including, for example, those who curate Facebook pages).
- Launch a social media campaign to encourage Californians to participate despite the citizenship question and/or lack of options to accurately identify one's ethnicity and/or family structure.

- Engage social media platforms and influencers in all aspects of life (i.e. sports, medicine, the arts, etc.) to explain why it is important to participate in the Census.
 - Utilize social and other media that reach specifically targeted HTC populations across all ages and ethnicities.
 - Engage people in digital dialogues around these topics.
- Employ non-traditional entertainment and ethnic media (examples include *mitú* and youth media hubs) to produce visually powerful, relatable content that reaches immigrant and non-citizen households through storytelling and other proven methods.
 - Explore partnerships with new media organizations that focus on dispelling myths on immigration (For example, Define American places stories from non-citizens, has new media storytelling capacity, and the connections to influence entertainment storyline work.)
 - Develop a rapid response mechanism for potential misinformation campaigns across both print and digital mediums. Engage DACA youth and others who are able to easily engage non-citizens to help identify a prototype for rapid response during the census count. (Potential partnerships could include the UCLA DREAM Resource Center, FWD.us, and the Latino Coalition for a Healthy California.)
 - Organize a census-focused hackathon specifically for DACA youth and non-citizens to 1) begin to develop grassroots infrastructure for rapid response, and 2) gather information regarding trusted messengers and social media channels.

Section 6. Next Steps

The California Complete Count Committee is moving forward to gather information and expertise to refine its recommendations for the State's strategy for outreach and communication to ensure a 2020 Census complete count in California. These recommendations will be shared in the Committee's next report in January 2019.

DRAFT

APPENDIX A: California Complete Count Committee Membership

Current positions are listed for Committee members. For additional information visit: <https://census.ca.gov/2018/04/16/governor-brown-creates-california-complete-count-committee/>.

- **Gita Amar**, Senior Director at PMK BNC
- **Tho Vinh Banh**, Supervising Attorney and Supervisor of Multicultural Affairs Outreach at Disability Rights California
- **Carolyn Coleman**, Executive Director at the League of California Cities
- **Kathleen Domingo**, Director for Office of Life, Justice and Peace at the Archdiocese of Los Angeles
- **Basim Elkarra**, Executive Director at the Sacramento Valley Chapter of the Council on American-Islamic Relations
- **Efrain Escobedo**, Vice President for Education and Immigration Programs at the California Community Foundation
- **Amy Fairweather**, Policy Director at Swords to Plowshares' Institute for Veteran Policy
- **Nicholas Hatten**, Executive Director at the San Joaquin Pride Center
- **Lisa Hershey**, Executive Director at Housing California
- **John Joanino**, Senior Communications Associate at Advancement Project California
- **Alex Johnson**, Managing Director at Californians for Safety and Justice
- **Loren Kaye**, Foundation President at the California Chamber of Commerce
- **Kate Kendell**, Executive Director at the National Center for Lesbian Rights
- **Jesus Martinez**, Founding Member and Chair at the Central Valley Immigrant Integration Collaborative
- **Gerald McIntyre**, Special Counsel at Justice in Aging, formerly the National Senior Citizens Law Center
- **Margie Mejia**, Chairwoman at the Lytton Rancheria of California
- **Eloy Ortiz Oakley**, Chancellor of the California Community Colleges
- **Jennifer Rodriguez**, Executive Director at the Youth Law Center
- **Thomas Saenz**, President and General Counsel at MALDEF
- **Lee Salter**, Former President and Chief Executive Officer at the McConnell Foundation
- **Daniel Torres**, Director of Immigrant Integration in the Office of Governor Edmund G. Brown Jr.
- **Angie Wei**, Chief of Staff at the California Labor Federation
- **Regina Brown Wilson**, Director at California Black Media
- **Christopher Wilson**, Associate Director at Alliance San Diego
- **Tom K. Wong**, Associate Professor at the University of California, San Diego

For additional information on CCCC membership, meetings, minutes, and materials, visit <https://census.ca.gov>.

CCCC Documents

- Executive Order: <https://census.ca.gov/2018/04/15/be-counted-california/>
- Members: <https://census.ca.gov/2018/04/16/governor-brown-creates-california-complete-count-committee/>
- Meeting Agendas and Minutes: <https://census.ca.gov/cccc-meetings-2018/>

DRAFT

APPENDIX B: References

Section 2. Background on the Census and California

California Business, Transportation and Housing Agency, *2000 California Complete Count Report to the Governor, Counting all Californians* (2000)

California Complete Count Committee, *2010 California Complete Count Report to the Governor, Counting 2010 and Planning for 2020* (2010)

Election Data Services, [2017 Reapportionment Analysis](#) (2017)

Government Accountability Office, [2017 High Risk Report: 2020 Decennial Census](#) (2017)

Government Accountability Office, [2020 Census: Continued Management Attention Needed to Mitigate Key Risks Jeopardizing a Cost-Effective and Secure Enumeration](#) (2018)

Institute for Constitutional Advocacy and Protection, Georgetown University Law Center, [Letter on Census Cyber Security](#) (2018)

Judicial Council of California, [Strategic Plan for Language Access in the California Courts](#) (2015) Pew Research Center, [Public Trust in Government: 1958 - 2017](#) (2017)

Public Policy Institute of California, [Californians and the 2020 Census](#) (2018)

U.S. Census Bureau, 2012-2016 American Community Survey 5-Year Estimates

U.S. Department of Commerce, U.S. Census Bureau, *Proposed Information Collection; Comment Request; 2020 Census*, 83 Federal Register 111, (8 June 2018), Page 26646

Section 3. Census Roles and Partnerships

U.S. Census Bureau, *Guide for Complete Count Committees* (2017); website: https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/decennial-census/2020-census/complete_count.html

Section 5a. Housing

Cindy Quezada, Central Valley Immigrant Integration Collaborative, *Identifying households the Census may miss in 2020: Fresno and Stockton case studies*. Presentation to the California Complete Count Committee Housing Working Group (2018); website: <https://census.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/4/2018/08/073018-LUCA-Project-Gov-CCC-Presentation.pdf>.

Ed Kissam, WKF Giving Fund, *An Effective Strategy To Reduce Census Undercount: Results from California Pilots of Community-Based Address Canvassing* (2018); website: https://uploads-ssl.webflow.com/59fb4f76691c1b000103c309/5a986f3918c20000013e8461_Findings%20from%20CA%20Community-based%20Address%20Canvassing%20FINAL%202-24-18.pdf.

Grantmakers Concerned with Immigrants and Refugees, *GCIR's California Counts! 2010 Census Campaign: A Network Approach to Funder Collaboration* (2012); website: https://www.gcir.org/sites/default/files/resources/California%20Counts%20July%202012_0.pdf

Section 5b. Trust and Confidentiality

U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services information on Temporary Protected Status (2018); website: <https://www.uscis.gov/humanitarian/temporary-protected-status>

DRAFT