



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group

August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm



Members Present:

John Joanino (Chair)

Advancement Project California

Kathleen Domingo

Archdiocese of Los Angeles

Gita Amar

PMK BNC

Loren Kaye

California Chamber of Commerce

Members Absent:

Tom Wong

University of California, San Diego

Other Committee Members, Staff:

California Complete Count Committee

Patricia Vazquez-Topete

Dan Torres, Chair

California State University, Sacramento

Ariel Ambruster

Jennifer Mair

Handouts and Presentations:

- July 2, 2018 Draft Working Group Meeting Minutes
- July 30, 2018 Draft Working Group Meeting Minutes
- Complete Count Committee Process Plan for Report to the Governor

1. Opening Procedures

Chair John Joanino called the meeting to order. He welcomed members and referred to Patricia Vazquez-Topete, California Complete Count Committee (CCCC), for a roll call. A quorum of at least three members was established with four members present and one absent.

Chair Joanino reviewed the agenda and the purpose of the meeting, with the focus on developing recommended content for the initial report to the Governor's Office. Approval of meeting minutes from July 30th was moved by Gita Amar and seconded by Loren Kaye. Approval of meeting minutes from July 2nd was moved by Loren Kaye and seconded by Kathleen Domingo. All members present voted to approve both meeting minutes.

2. Committee Initial Report to Governor – Context and Schedule

Chair Joanino reviewed the purpose, process and timeline for drafting the Complete Count Committee's Initial Report to the Governor's Office (Report), due October 1, 2018. The purpose



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group



August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm

of the report is to recommend initial outreach strategies to encourage full participation in Census by California residents, and avoid an undercount in Census 2020. The report is being drafted by staff at California State University Sacramento in collaboration with CCCC staff, based on the input from this and other work groups. There will be an iterative draft and review process between now and October 1st. Key dates are listed in the handout. The Committee will have final review and vote on the report to submit to the Governor's Office at the meeting of the entire CCCC on October 1st. There are no questions or comments.

3. Committee Initial Report to Governor – Working Group Purpose

Chair Joanino proposed an initial purpose statement for the Working Group to consider:

"The purpose of the Content and Citizenship Working Group is to advise California Complete Count staff and the Governor's Office on outreach and media strategies to encourage census participation among mixed status households, non-citizen residents and other respondents who may be deterred by a citizenship question."

Loren Kaye asked for clarification whether that is the only purpose of the Working Group. Chair Joanino responded that he sees this as the focus for this Working Group, in light of the work of other working groups, but the question is open to discussion. Loren Kaye said he leans toward not limiting the Working Group's purpose to advising on outreach related to the citizenship question. He suggested changing "deterred by a citizenship question" to a more general statement, such as "deterred from participation due to distrust or unfamiliarity with government." Both Loren Kaye and Gita Amar expressed concern in not having a written document to refer to.

Gita Amar agreed, saying she preferred that the purpose take a broader approach, encouraging participation from as many people as possible during the Census.

Chair Joanino noted that the purpose of the full CCCC is to encourage participation of all Californians, and suggested that this Working Group has a narrower focus on content and citizenship.

Kathleen Domingo expressed that her understanding of this Working Group is also to be more specific, and that to be most effective, it is better to narrow its parameters.

Dan Torres suggested the proposed purpose is missing the content element: the content of the census form, and the need to inform people on how they can self-identify on the census form. This is an issue for LGBTQ communities, regarding gender identification. He noted that this is the only Working Group that has this charge.

Gita Amar agreed that the purpose needs to address the content issue, remembering the initial discussion from the first CCCC meeting of how LGBT families and various ethnic groups were



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group



August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm

not going to be able to accurately declare their status. She said the purpose of the Working Group is to recommend strategies to encourage the participation of all Californians in the census. Dan Torres suggested he would add that they know how to self-identify on the census form and have the information they need to do so.

Chair Joanino opened the floor for public comments on this agenda item. There are no public comments.

A facilitator from Sacramento State said she will help consolidate suggestions from the Working Group into a draft purpose statement. CCCC members will have an opportunity in September to review the draft report and provide high-level individual comments on the draft, and will review and finalize the report during the October 1st meeting.

4. Committee Initial Report to Governor – Specific Issues of Concern

Chair Joanino opened the discussion on the next agenda item, issues of concern to include in the report to the Governor. He opened the floor to the Working Group and after waiting for comment, expressed his concern that the U.S. Census Bureau has not approved waivers for hiring non-citizen residents as census enumerators. This adds to the barrier of the Census Bureau finding sufficient numbers of trusted messengers with cultural and linguistic competencies who can communicate effectively with mixed status households and non-resident citizens. He asked if anyone would like to add to this concern.

Loren Kaye said this is related to a more general concern, asking if there will be research done among populations of concern to see who they consider trusted messengers. He asked if they will be updated regarding the research being conducted on this topic by the Blue Shield Foundation.

A facilitator from Sacramento State who also facilitates for the State a group of private and foundation message testers said there is current work and research being conducted to identify trusted messengers and messages and more information will be available on this topic in the future.

Loren Kaye expressed that he would like to review additional research related to the general characteristics of trusted messengers, as well as the ways messages are delivered, including via door to door, media, and informal networks.

Chair Joanino elaborated on his concern, saying that in the past the Census Bureau has requested waivers in order to hire non-citizens such as DACA youth and others as census-takers. This cycle, the U.S. government has indicated it does not plan to seek a waiver, adding a large



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group



August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm

challenge to finding those who can communicate with mixed status households and non-citizen residents. This has eroded public trust.

Chair Joanino asked for other concerns from the Working Group. After a pause, he added another concern regarding wanting clarity from the U.S. Census Bureau about non-response follow up and lack of response, saying it is still unclear if people will be able to submit the census form if the citizenship question is not filled out. The answer to this question would really help the Working Group understand how to outreach to non-citizen residents.

Patricia Vazquez-Topete said the CCC office has submitted this question to the U.S. Census Bureau, and they hope the Bureau will address it in the upcoming October 1st meeting.

Gita Amar raised another concern, saying some groups have been talking about boycotting the census, and are unaware of the impacts this will have. This needs to be discussed as something that can be harmful to California and the populations that would be hurt the most.

Chair Joanino seconded this concern. He said he is also concerned about misinformation related to the census, hacking and the use of social media platforms to spread distrust. He asked whether the State has the infrastructure to address misinformation, which would include responding to calls for a boycott of the census as a way to express dissatisfaction with the government.

Loren Kaye asked for clarification around who has raised the idea of a boycott. Gita Amar answered that she has heard this from people she works with, mainly younger people. Millennials don't trust the government and don't understand the impact a boycott would have on funding for programming across the state. She said there is great distrust because of the news about election hacking and disinformation on social media. She expressed there is not enough education on how boycotting will impact Californians and that this Working Group needs to include outreach messaging that states that participation in the census makes a difference to California regardless of the greater political environment.

Loren Kaye added that this speaks to the need to have a focused outreach effort for Hard to Count (HTC) populations, but also for easy to reach populations who are skeptical of the census. Chair Joanino agreed that a potential boycott needs to be addressed, and remembered that in 2010 a group of clergy was encouraging a boycott of the census. He expressed that now this issue is heightened, and it is important to address this possibility.

Chair Joanino recapped the general concerns of the Working Group as:

1. Addressing the barriers to the U.S. Census Bureau hiring enumerators, including



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group



August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm

- The need to hire those with specific cultural and linguistic skills to reach households that may not otherwise trust census outreach officials.
- The lack of a waiver to hire DACA youth and non-citizen residents who can convince other non-citizen residents to fill out the census form.

2. Concerns around cyber security, social media, disinformation and the erosion of public trust.

3. Concerns with potential boycotting of the census by various groups.

He asked if there were any other concerns to add.

A facilitator from Sacramento State asked if the group has considered what the concerns are related to the content part of the Working Group. Dan Torres added that in addition to the citizenship question, the Working Group should consider how to outreach to people who may need help self-identifying in terms of the race and ethnicity questions based on the limited categories included in the census questionnaire.

Gita Amar added that recognition of different types of households is also a content question that should be considered. She suggested that they consider different messaging strategies, including the use of social media and digital dialogues, to engage people who want to know more to effectively participate in the census.

Chair Joanino asked if there are other comments related to concerns around the content of the census questionnaire. He then opened the floor to public comment. There were no comments.

5. Committee Initial Report to Governor – Recommended Outreach Strategies

Chair Joanino opened the discussion by encouraging Working Group members to propose innovative, pie-in-the-sky ideas that may not have been thought of by others.

Gita Amar suggested launching a social media campaign to encourage Californians to participate despite the citizenship question. The campaign would include engaging people across social media platforms, and using influencers from all aspects of life (i.e. sports, medicine, the arts), and all ages and ethnicities to explain why it is important to participate in the census.

Loren Kaye agreed with this, stating it is important to understand who the right messengers are. Knowing who is trusted will drive the outreach strategy. He recommended identifying trusted messengers in various spheres, including family, church, and other local community leaders.

Gita Amar suggested involving organizations that are already engaged with HTC populations, as it is not the Working Group's place to choose trusted messengers but to rely on various communities to share who these trusted messenger resources are. The State needs to determine



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group



August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm

who the particular trusted messengers are from various micro communities, to hear from them who they trust. She suggested a varied outreach approach through social media, segmented for various smaller communities, including engaging curators of Facebook pages that are micro-targeted to various age and ethnic groups.

Gita Amar then asked a clarifying question on whether there are supplemental groups in California who are assisting with census enumeration where non-citizen residents can be employed.

Dan Torres clarified that the U.S. Census Bureau does the hiring, and they have not yet clarified what the waiver process is. On the California side, the State can focus on the question of how to work with those who understand how to best outreach to non-citizen residents.

Chair Joanino suggested the State can use data to identify where there are concentrations of people who will be concerned with the citizenship question, and focus resources on those areas.

Dan Torres informed the group that there is existing, detailed data on all HTC populations and encouraged the group to think holistically on how to leverage resources to reach HTC populations.

Chair Joanino suggested that state funding should be allocated specifically to groups that have a record of successful outreach and engagement to HTC populations via social services and other services, especially those with a focus on mixed status households and non-citizen residents.

Kathleen Domingo agreed that identifying and supporting organizations that have a proven track record of outreach, who are known and trusted, and who have recent relationships with HTC communities is very important.

Chair Joanino made another recommendation to focus on engaging media and advertising experts who utilize storytelling and visuals that go beyond traditional forms, and who have a proven track record of reaching non-citizen residents. He suggested leveraging entertainment and ethnic media who can reach immigrant households and tell stories they can identify with.

Chair Joanino submitted another recommendation, a hackathon to engage DACA youth to help identify a prototype for rapid response to engaging non-citizen residents during the census. He mentioned a successful hackathon held by Los Angeles County, and suggested partnering with organizations like UCLA DREAM Resource Center, FWD.us, and the Latino Coalition for a Healthy California, to help identify community-based solutions for engaging non-resident citizens on the importance of the census. This community is culturally knowledgeable, can help with outreach, and can also help produce a product that can be used during a rapid response deployment.



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group



August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm

Kathleen Domingo seconded that a hackathon would be great to engaging DACA youth, as well as to learn from them what social media platforms they are using and how to engage them in platforms they listen to and trust.

Gita Amar asked about other types of media and possible recommendations on employing specific media. Chair Joanino responded that their Working Group can make these recommendations now, as well as later.

Dan Torres asked if the Working Group had any input on how to reach people concerned with the content of the census questionnaire and being able to self-identify.

Kathleen Domingo agreed that this is an important question, as well as the need to identify trusted messengers. Loren Kaye seconded the importance of having research to understand who trusted messengers are for various communities.

Kathleen Domingo suggested adding to the recommendations that research be conducted on who trusted messengers are to reach those concerned with both the content and citizenship questions, those who will be trusted to reach micro-targeted communities.

Chair Joanino recommended that educational work needs to be done to explain why accurate census data is important, why the data is being gathered and how it is being used. It will be important for people to feel a personal connection to what is at stake during the census count, and to understand how they will benefit from accurately filling out the census form. Education work needs to be done to help people understand that the risks of providing this information are outweighed by the benefits, why it is worthwhile and in their best interests.

Chair Joanino opened the floor for public comment.

One member of the public noted that the State might leverage the efforts of companies doing target marketing outreach strategies, such as those that helped the #metoo movement gain momentum.

Another member of the public who works for a State official noted that her office is doing census 101 training. She said that what is resonating most with participants is an understanding of how census data is being used, and why it matters to be counted. She encouraged the Working Group to think about how it will impact people on a personal level, stating it is a personal issue to be accurately counted.

Chair Joanino moved to include the discussed purpose, concerns, and strategies into the draft report. Gita Amar seconded the motion. There were no objections or additional comments and all members present voted yes.



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group

August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm



6. Next Steps

The facilitator from Sacramento state reviewed the timeline for the Working Group and committee to offer their feedback and edits on the draft report, and for finalization of the report.

There were no additional comments.

7. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 3:02 pm by group consensus.

ADDENDUM

Draft Working Group Purpose, Concerns and Recommendations paraphrased by Sacramento State based on the input of the Content and Citizenship Working Group meeting of 08-31-2018.

Purpose:

Advise California Complete Count Staff and the Governor's Office on outreach and media strategies to encourage census participation among mixed status households, non-citizen residents and other respondents who may be deterred from filling out the census form due to fear or confusion of how to accurately and safely self-identify, specifically in light of the citizenship question and lack of categories to accurately account for ethnicity and family structure.

Alternate Purpose Statement:

Advise California Complete Count Staff and the Governor's Office on:

1. Content-related issues, including recommending strategies to encourage the participation of individuals who may be deterred by census questionnaire content, including the lack of questions related to gender identity; the lack of a Middle Eastern or North African (MENA) category, and the framing of the race and ethnicity questions around Latino, Hispanic or Spanish origin individuals; and
2. Citizenship-related issues, including outreach and media strategies to encourage census participation among California residents, particularly mixed status households, non-citizen



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group

August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm



residents and other respondents who may be deterred by a citizenship question, general distrust of or unfamiliarity with government, and other participation barriers.

Concerns:

1. California is able to hire trusted messengers to perform census outreach activities, especially considering the current hostile environment toward immigrants.
 - There is concern that those with specific cultural and linguistic skills to reach households that may not trust the census process may not be hired.
 - There is concern that DACA youth and other non-citizens who can convince non-citizens of the importance of filling out the census form may not be hired. The federal government has not approved waivers to hire non-citizens that may be trusted messengers working in census offices or during the door to door follow up outreach.
 - There is concern with having adequate research and information to accurately identify who trusted messengers are for various communities across California, especially those who will be impacted most by the inclusion of the citizenship question.
2. California has the infrastructure to adequately address potential issues and concerns with cyber security, the use of social media to spread mis-information, the erosion of public trust in media and government, and the security of personal information.
3. The potential boycotting of the census by various groups is quickly and effectively addressed through educational messaging stressing the consequences of non-participation for Californians.
4. The need for education and information on how to accurately self-identify on the census questionnaire in light of limited categories for ethnicity and family structure, as well as the inclusion of citizenship question.

Recommendations:

1. Educate all Californians on what is at stake with each census count, how data is being collected and how it will be used.
 - Educational materials should provide accurate information on how to self-identify, and what happens in the case of census partial response.



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group



August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm

- Educational outreach efforts should focus on helping people understand their personal connection to the census, how they will benefit from accurately filling out the census form, and how the risks of providing this information are outweighed by the benefits.
2. Fund organizations who best understand how to reach non-citizen residents during the census count, and concentrate outreach efforts based on geographically concentrated areas of HTC populations.
 - Prioritization should be given to organizations who have a proven track record and both recent and long-standing historical relationships with HTC and non-citizen resident communities.
 - Focus on organizations that help non-citizens attain legal permanent residency, naturalization, health care and social services.
 - Funding should also go to civic engagement coalitions that work with families and immigrants such as the Million Voters Project.
 3. Identify trusted messengers in multiple spheres, including family, church, and other local community leaders who can accurately convey the importance of participating in the census, and what is at stake for Californians.
 - Engage community leaders connected with smaller, targeted Hard to Count (HTC) populations (including, for example, those who curate Facebook pages).
 4. Launch a social media campaign to encourage Californians to participate despite the citizenship question and/or lack of options to accurately identify one's ethnicity and/or family structure.
 - Engage social media platforms and influencers in all aspects of life (i.e. sports, medicine, the arts, etc.) to explain why it is important to participate in the Census.
 - Utilize social and other media that reach specifically targeted HTC populations across all ages and ethnicities.
 - Engage people in digital dialogues around these topics.
 5. Employ non-traditional entertainment and ethnic media (examples include Mitu and youth media hubs) to produce visually powerful, relatable content that reaches immigrant and non-citizen households through storytelling and other proven methods.
 - Explore partnerships with new media organizations that focus on dispelling myths on immigration. (For example, Define American places stories from non-citizens, has



California Complete Count Committee

Content and Citizenship Working Group

August 31, 2018 1:00 pm - 3:00 pm



new media storytelling capacity, and the connections to influence entertainment storyline work.)

6. Develop a rapid response mechanism for potential misinformation campaigns across both print and digital mediums.
 - Engage DACA youth and others who are able to easily engage non-citizens to help identify a prototype for rapid response during the census count. (Potential partnerships could include the UCLA DREAM Resource Center, FWD.us, the Latino Coalition for a Healthy California.)
 - Organize a census-focused hackathon specifically for DACA youth and non-citizens to 1) begin to develop grassroots infrastructure for rapid response, and 2) gather information regarding trusted messengers and social media channels.

DRAFT