California Complete Count Committee  
Content and Citizenship Working Group  
July 30, 2018 1:30pm – 4:00pm

**Members Present:**

- John Joanino (Chair)  
  Advancement Project California
- Loren Kaye  
  California Chamber of Commerce
- Patricia Vazquez-Topete  
  California Complete Count Committee

**Members Not Present:**

- Tom Wong  
  University of California, San Diego
- Cathleen Domingo  
  Archdiocese of Los Angeles
- Gita Amar  
  PMK BNC

**Staff Present:**

- Patricia Vazquez-Topete  
  California Complete Count Committee

**Handouts and Presentations:**

- None

1. **Call Meeting to Order**

Chairperson John Joanino calls the meeting to order. As no quorum is established of the Working Group, no formal voting will be conducted and no motions approved per Bagley-Keene meeting requirements.

2. **Review and Approve Agenda**

The agenda was reviewed.

3. **Review and Approve Minutes from July 2, 2018 Conference Call**

July 2 Minutes were not reviewed or approved due to lack of quorum.

4. **Codify Working Group Goals**

John Joanino presented the following draft Working Group goals:

**Draft Goals:**

1) Identify research opportunities and existing data  
2) Engage messaging experts to involve families and address fear  
3) Provide input on most effective messaging strategies to combat misinformation about Census

Loren Kaye reminded participants that it is important to ensure this Working Group is not addressing same issues as other Working Group in order avoid duplicative efforts and potentially contradictory recommendations. Of particular concern for topical overlap is that of the Access
and Outreach Working Group. Members of this Working Group should consult with members of the other groups in the near future.

Mr. Joanino provided his understanding that the Access and Outreach Working Group will review and provide recommendations for specific demographic groups, while this Working Group will focus on the citizenship census form question, and on combating misinformation. These two groups should work collaboratively to develop an informed messaging strategy.

5. Identify Research Opportunities and Existing Data
Ms. Kaye expressed interest in further understanding if/how the citizenship question will impact residents’ participation in the census. The general assumption is that inclusion of this question generates fear (of immigration control, potential deportation, etc.), and will result in lower participation. It would be helpful to know if there has been any field testing conducted in hard-to-count (HTC) communities demonstrating empirical data that the inclusion of the citizenship question does, in fact, result in lower participation. Any pertinent research should be presented and reviewed by this Working Group. This would assist in bringing credibility to, or discrediting, this assumption.

Mr. Joanino recalled a presentation from a National Census meeting on how the citizenship question improves lower responses. This content should be located and made available for review. Ms. Kaye agreed, and added that apart from the effort to remove this question from the form, this Working Group should be looking at what can be done to address the problems the question may create.

Mr. Joanino offered that, furthermore, general fear of family separation and potential US Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) raids increase people’s fear and lower responses.

Public Comment
Bia Viera, GCIR, offered to provide some research on this subject conducted by Karen Narazaki to the Working Group members.

Richard Thompson, Blue Cross/ Blue Shield, shared that his organization is looking to invest in a research proposal, led by the California Institute for Rural Studies at UC Davis, that will be focused on the Central Valley and what the impact of the citizenship question would be. The research will specifically focus on Latino, Indigenous, and Hmong communities. The proposal is still in review, but if approved, results should be available around November.

Continued Working Group Discussion
Mr. Joanino is interested to understand all underlying fears and concerns by geography, in order to thoughtfully target certain areas with appropriate messaging, outreach efforts, etc.

Ms. Kaye recommends providing a series a question to focus group participants to generate clarity on what people’s specific fears may be. For example, fear of being exposed to ICE, fear
of embarrassment, fear of discrimination, etc. Mr. Thompson concurred that a set of research questions would be very helpful to funders in terms of framing their work moving forward. Mr. Joanino suggested Mr. Thompson connect with several of the civil rights organizations who have already been generating such a list. In addition, there are outstanding questions for the bureau, such whether people have to answer the citizenship question in order to move on in answering the rest of the census questionnaire; and, at what point is the information considered not to be useful because so much is imputed.

Mr. Joanino commented that the group is still in the information gathering state, and would like to continue conversations around research design when all Working Group members are available for discussion.

Mr. Joanino shared the Secretary of State will be holding a press conference requesting the public to make comments on the citizenship question. The deadline for comment is August 7th.

**Public Comment**
Eliana Kaimowitz suggested there should be two sets of research findings: one for citizenship question, and one for privacy concerns.

6. **Discuss Communications Tactics to Reach HTC**
Related to privacy concerns, Mr. Joanino shared that at the Nation Census meeting, there conversations happening around both internal privacy (hacking of enumerators) and external privacy (general privacy). He emphasized the importance of having some form of infrastructure to address misinformation. Ms. Kaye agreed, and commented that FaceBook will likely raise the alert on this topic.

Ms. Viera shared there was a meeting held with the National Census Bureau, Silicon Valley Community Foundation, and various tech companies in July to begin conversation on Census. She suggests this group should connect with Gina Delma.

7. **Experts/Specialists**
The Working Group brainstormed potential messaging experts to help guide their work, in addition to the persons referenced during discussions on previous agenda items. The following suggestions were provided:
- Review the list of persons involved in the Messaging Research group, provided by Efrain Escobedo during the morning CCCC meeting.
- Wells Fargo Foundation (involved as part of the growing funder table)

8. **Planning for the Upcoming Governor’s Outreach Report**
Patricia Vazquez-Topete suggested the Working Group review the timeline embedded in the report overview document that Dan Torres provided.

9. **Scheduling Future Meetings and Agenda Items**
The next meeting will be contingent upon responses to scheduling, though the aim is the first week of each month.

10. Adjournment
   The meeting was adjourned by Chair Joanino.