



California Complete Count Committee

Trust and Confidentiality Working Group

July 30, 2018 1:30 - 4:00pm



Members Present:

Basim Elkarra

Council on American-Islamic Relations

Tom Saenz

Mexican American Legal Defense and Educational Fund

Gerald McIntyre

Justice in Aging

Members Absent:

Angie Wei (Chair)

California Labor Federation

Staff Present:

Ditas Katague

California Complete Count Committee, Chair

Alana Golden

California Complete Count Committee

Sophie Carrillo-Mandel

California State University, Sacramento

Handouts and Presentations:

- None

1. Call meeting to order

Tom Saenz calls the meeting to order in Chair Angie Wei's absence. He refers to Alana Golden, Census Staff Liaison, for roll call. Three members are needed to establish a quorum, and three members are counted present.

2. Approve previous working group meeting minutes

The July 3 Working Group meeting minutes are approved unanimously with the following changes:

- “He mentions how we should also share with the public that anyone who violates Title 13 will go to prison for violating the Census **confidentiality**.” [previously “confidentially”]. (p. 2)
- “Tom Saenz mentioned the issue with cyber security and how the communities might not currently trust a lot of the **tech**” [previously “teach”] companies.” (p. 2)
- “The working group discusses the possibility of reaching out to financial working groups that have learned what **consumers** [previously “costumers”] need to hear...” (p. 3)
- “Tom Saenz [previously “Wong”] motions to adjourn the meeting.” (p. 3)



California Complete Count Committee

Trust and Confidentiality Working Group



July 30, 2018 1:30 - 4:00pm

3. Discuss the Three Agreed Upon Goals for the Working Group

Tom Saenz shares that, first, the lack of trust in the digital nature of this Census might be worth calling out separately from the previously agreed upon goals. Second, there is public fear that not only confidentiality might be breached, but also that aggregate data can be used against certain groups of people.

Gerald McIntyre states that he is unclear how aggregate data from census might be used negatively, because much of that aggregate data is likely already public knowledge.

Tom Saenz poses that the citizenship information could be new and could inform ICE of the location of groups of undocumented residents, though this information is available through other data. He conversely posits that populations change so quickly anyway, that the aggregate census data might be out of date for citizenship purposes by the time it is released. Members discuss if raising the issue of potential misuse of aggregate data would create more fear about this subject than already exists, rather than assuage existing fears. In addition, there is overlap with the Content and Citizenship Working Group.

Tom Saenz suggests that the Working Group propose to the State the need to address the fears of the public about misuse of aggregate public census data. He then moves to add the language “from either government misuse or technological breach” to the end of the group’s first goal. Gerald McIntyre seconds the motion.

The goals for the group now read:

- 1) To help provide ideas as to how the state can guarantee protection for peoples’ confidential information **from either government misuse or technological breach.**
- 2) To inform the state and the CCC of messaging that will help us to build higher trust with the hard to count (HTC) communities.
- 3) To identify concerns on the ground and in communities, and to develop specific strategies or tactics that we can use to address these specific concerns.

4. Discuss Experts/Specialists to Consult and/or to Present at Future Meetings

Tom Saenz asks for recommendations for experts and specialists to consult in the pursuit of the Working Group’s three goals.

Basim Elkarra commits to finding the name of an appropriate person from the California Emergent Technology Fund. This group is aware of the issues in question and was recommended by both Yanina Casillas and the Asian Law Caucus.

Tom Saenz suggests reaching out to Google, Amazon, or another representative of the corporate tech industry. Mr. Elkarra suggests Mufaddal Ezzy, the California manager for Google Government Relations, who used to work in the Capitol.



California Complete Count Committee

Trust and Confidentiality Working Group

July 30, 2018 1:30 - 4:00pm



Tom Saenz asks Ditas Katague if she has any relevant suggestions. Director Katague recommends Alex Stamos, head of cyber security for Facebook, who helps the company conduct a “Bug Bounty” program. Mr. Elkarra will look into contacting this person. Ditas Katague states that she will meet with the US Census Bureau (USCB) next week and ask about appropriate contacts on this topic.

Tom Saenz asks if there is a USCB specialist on government misuse of data and Title 13, or if there might be appropriate contacts at the Department of Justice. Director Katague indicates that it is within the scope of the Working Group to write USCB and ask about this, and that the USCB contacts are very responsive to inquiries. Basim Elkarra shares that James Schwab has been meeting with interested groups about Title 13 and that the group can reach out to Mr. Schwab for helpful contacts.

5. Report and Outreach

a. Draft Framework for the Upcoming Governor’s Office Report

Tom Saenz asks for more information about the requirements and parameters of the Governor’s Office report. Director Katague explains that for the report due on October 1, the Working Group needs to convey what the group is investigating, why it is investigating this, what their approach is for the investigation, and what immediate findings need attention.

This report will be due October 1, the next report will be due in January 2019, and then June, and then a report will be due every January and June until 2021.

b. Recommendations for Governor’s Outreach Report

Tom Saenz suggests sharing as a recommendation that California’s confidentiality policies may seem redundant to the federal government’s, but these policies could be reassuring for those members of the public who do not trust the federal government.

Working Group members and staff confirm that staff will coordinate with the four CCCC working groups to ensure that messaging from the four working groups aligns.

Gerald McIntyre asks what happens if someone does not fill out the citizenship question on the census. Tom Saenz replies that that section can be filled in by USCB from other data, or USCB can follow up the item as a non-response. As a digital document, USCB could now use stop-logic so that the Census form stops progressing if a question is not answered. Staff member Alana Golden shares that on hardcopy questionnaires in the past, USCB has been able to receive incomplete surveys. If stop-logic technology is used and results in many incomplete surveys, the missing data could cause problems for USCB.

Gerald McIntyre acknowledges that the citizenship question is a specific issue of concern to be articulated by this group.



California Complete Count Committee

Trust and Confidentiality Working Group

July 30, 2018 1:30 - 4:00pm



Tom Saenz mentions that it is against the law to not fill out the Census, so that government representatives cannot advocate not filling out a question on the census form. Basim Elkarra notes agreement.

6. Working Group Future Scheduling and Next Agenda Items

The three Working Group members agree to respond with their individual availability by the end of the week.

Gerald McIntyre recommends that as a group they should let the CCCC organizers know at least a week ahead of time if they are unable to attend, so that committee members do not spend their time traveling far for an event if a quorum will not be achieved and they will be unable to vote.

7. Public Comment

Regarding the issue of instilling more fear in the public, Sophie Carrillo-Mandel shares that at the Riverside Regional Convening, a speaker stated that neglecting to fill out the census form is not how to keep undocumented residents safe, because that data is not difficult to find elsewhere. This speaker said that having accurate information and visibility about vulnerable immigrant populations from the census is how California can work towards keeping its residents safe.

Tom Saenz replies that there is positive messaging that needs to be presented, but that this group does have to focus on the negativity, and that this working group's purpose is to minimize the risks more than accentuate the benefits.

Alana Golden states that the media group that reported in the greater CCCC meeting that morning addresses positive messaging.

Gerald McIntyre poses an open question: If the group is asking the public to trust, *who* is it that the public is being asked to trust?

8. Motion to Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned by motion at 2:23 PM.